No. 1959-68 CIVIL ACTION

Thomasuille Durniture Industries VERSUS Inc.

Abraham L. Kaminstein, Regultes of Capynighto

DATE	COURT CLERK'S MEMORANDUM	JUSTICE
-		
-		
•		No.
No. of the last of		

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

THOMASVILLE FURNITURE INDUSTRIES, INC.,

Plaintiff

Address:

Thomasville, North Carolina

Civil Action
No. 1959-68

V.

ABRAHAM L. KAMINSTEIN, REGISTER OF COPYRIGHTS,

Defendant

EILED

AUG 2 1968

ROBERT M. STEARNS, Clerk

COMPLAINT

For Declaratory Judgment And Mandatory Injunction Under the Copyright Laws, Title 17 U.S.C.

- 1. Jurisdiction of this Court is founded upon the Copyright Laws, Title 17 U.S.C., particularly sections 10, 11, 13, 19, 208 and 209 thereof, and upon 28 U.S.C. sections 1338(a), 2201 and 2202; venue is laid in this District under 28 U.S.C., Sections 1391(c) and 1400(a).
- 2. Plaintiff, Thomasville Furniture Industries, Inc., is a corporation incorporated according to the laws of the State of North Carolina, and has its principal office and place of business at Thomasville, North Carolina.
- 3. Defendant, Register of Copyrights, is a resident of the District of Columbia.
- 4. Plaintiff Thomasville Furniture Industries,
 Inc. is the proprietor of all copyrightable material in and
 to certain artistically sculpted designs denominated,
 respectively, "Allegro Semainier", "Allegro Night Stand",
 "Allegro Desk", "Allegro Corner Desk", "Allegro Chest",
 "Allegro Low Chest", "Allegro Double Dresser", and "Allegro

Triple Dresser", hereinafter referred to as the "Allegro" designs.

- 5. On April 22, 1966, Plaintiff first publicly placed on sale, sold or publicly distributed copies of each of the aforementioned artistically sculpted "Allegro" designs. Statutory notice of claim to copyright, "Copyright Thomasville Furniture Industries, Inc., 1966", was affixed to the first copy and each subsequent copy of each such work published, offered for sale or sold within the United States.
- 6. On May 8, 1968, plaintiff made application for registration of its claim to copyright in each of the aforementioned "Allegro" designs, by duly filing with the defendant eight applications for registration of plaintiff's claim to copyright in each of the eight "Allegro" designs, in copyright Class G, which pertains to works of art and designs for works of art. With each such application, plaintiff tendered deposit copies, in the form and number provided by 17 U.S.C. 13, illustrating the work. With each such application plaintiff also tendered the statutory registration fee of \$6.00.
- 7. Plaintiff has fully complied with all of the provisions of Title 17, U.S.C., including the notice of copyright, the application for registration of claim to copyright, the deposit of copies, and the payment of the registration fee, as to each of the "Allegro" sculpted designs.
- 8. On May 27, 1968, the defendant, or others acting under the authority of the defendant, wrongfully and erroneously refused to register the plaintiff's claims to

copyright for the aforesaid artistically sculpted "Allegro" designs solely on the alleged ground that none of plaintiff's designs can be "identified as a work of art for copyright purposes".

9. The refusal of the defendant to register plaintiff's claims to copyright, as aforesaid, is a final action of the Register of Copyrights, for which no other review is provided by the Copyright Laws.

WHEREFORE, plaintiff demands the following relief:

- A. A judgment declaring that plaintiff's artistically sculpted "Allegro" designs constitute works of art within the meaning of the Copyright Statutes.
- B. An order compelling the defendant to register plaintiff's claims to copyright in each of its artistically sculpted "Allegro" designs, and to issue to plaintiff the Certificate of Registration provided for by 17 U.S.C. 209.
- C. Such other and further relief as to the Court may seem meet and just.

CUSHMAN, DARBY & CUSHMAN Attorneys for Plaintiff

Bv

45th Street, N.W.

Washington, D.C. Telephone: NA 8-3460

Of Counsel; William K. West, Jr., Esq.

at elle set i di el tila lingua di degli ancidi sendigi ancidi setti setti setti setti setti setti setti setti Li le elle se se si tila alagni i i i i alagni a control setti i i ancidi setti setti setti setti setti setti

in , the contract of the contr

FILE D
AUG 2 1968
ROBERT M. STEARNS, Clerk

United States District Court

District of Columbia

1959-68

THOMASVILLE FURNITURE INDUSTRIES, INC.

CIVIL ACTION FILE NO.

SUMMONS

Plaintiff

V

ABRAHAM L. KAMINSTEIN, Register of copyrights

Defendant

To the above named Defendant:

You are hereby summoned and required to serve upon

CUSHMAN, DARBY & CUSHMAN JAMES L. DOOLEY

plaintiff's attorney , whose address

730 15th St., N.W.

Washington, D. C.

an answer to the complaint which is herewith served upon you, within days after service of this summons upon you, exclusive of the day of service. If you fail to do so, judgment by default will be taken against you for the relief demanded in the complaint.

ROBERT M. STEARNS

Clerk of Court.

Deputy Clerk.

Date:

August 2, 1968

[Seal of Court]

Note:—This summons is issued pursuant to Rule 4 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

RETURN ON SERVICE OF WRIT

I received this summons and served it together with the complaint herein as follows:

day of

19

I hereby certify and return, that on the

	[Seal of Court]
regulate para tem in writed documents of the triumfatta	
MARSHAL'S FEES	The total Chates March 1
Convice	United States Marshal.
	By
Subscribed and sworn to before me, a	this
day of ,19 .	
[SEAL]	
Sett staint To the above manace of females a	ney for
Muited States District Corners and The Forman The Forman The Property of the P	after service. Attor

Annted States District Court

· Former D.

CIA CECA

Deliver ONLY to addressee (Additional charges required for these services)
RECEIPT
Received the numbered article described on other side.
SIGNATURE OR NAME OF ADDRESSEE (must always be filled in)
Department of Justice
D Justice
Records Administration Office
SIGNATURE OF ADDRESSEES AGENT HE ANSection
Ralph R. Reynolds, Supervisor
le Note
DATE DELIVERED BY SHOW WHERE DELIVERED (only if requested)
8/7/68
C55-16-71548-5-F GPO

	POST OFFICE DEPARTME		PAYMENT OF POSTAGE, \$300
	Ġ.		POSTMARK OF DELIVERING OFFICE
	INSTRUCTIONS.		
Apr. 1962	instructions on other sid	ill in items below and complete e, if applicable. Moisten gummed rmly to back of article. Print on RECEIPT REQUESTED.	RETURN
✓	REGISTERED NO.	NAME OF SENDEN ARSHAL	COURT HOUSE
Form 36	G28048	WASHINGTON, D.	C. 20001
POD F	INSURED NO.	CITY, ZONE AND STATE	
			C55-16-71548-5-F

00 10 1160

(Rev. 4-15-67) RETURN ON SERVICE OF WRIT	
United States of America	LED
DISTRICT OF AUG	26 1960
ROBERT M S	TFADOL
	SALVINS CHECKS
vs.	
U.S. Marshal's No.	
SERVICE COMPLETED or ENDEAVOR TO SERVE	1 0
I hereby certify and return that I endeavored to serve the annexed served	(Writ)
on the therein-named Attorney June (Name of individual, company, corporation, etc.)	
by handing to and leaving a true and correct copy thereof with (if endeavor—des	cribe what was
done in endeavoring to serve) hem (Name of individual or agent of company, corporation,	etc.)
personally at (if endeavor—show addresses where endeavors made)	t. of
(Address—Street number, apartment number, rural route, etc.)	e said District
(City) (State)	e said District
at day ofday	19 60
SERVICE NOT COMPLETED	
Date	
I hereby certify and return, that on the day of	, 19,
I received the within	and that after
diligent search, I am unable to find the within named	
withi	n said district.

LUKE C. MOORE

Marshal's fees Mileage

United States Marshal.

Deputy.

Form USM-282 (Rev. 4-15-67)

RETURN ON SERVICE OF WRIT

United States of America

District of Olembial

	AUG 26 to
mæ Furniture Andustue fine Clerk's No.	1958 1968 1968
Abraham L. Kominstein, Legister of Copyright. U.S. Marshal's	M. STEARNS, Clerk
SERVICE COMPLETED or ENDEAVOR T	TO SERVE
I hereby certify and return that I endeavored to serve the an	nnexed limmons + Cony
on the therein-named	properation, etc.)
by handing to and leaving a true and correct copy thereof with (if U.S. District Court Hou	f endeavor—describe what was
done in endeavoring to serve)(Name of individual or agent of o	company, corporation, etc.)
at a.mp.m., on the day of	Meg , 1968.
SERVICE NOT COMPLETED	
	Date
I hereby certify and return, that on the day of	, 19,
I received the within	and that after
diligent search, I am unable to find the within named	
	within said district.
	MUKE C. MOORE
37 1 12 6	United States Marshal
Marshal's fees	
Mileage By	Onited States Marshall

Form USM-282 (Rev. 4-15-67)

RETURN ON SERVICE OF WRIT

United States of America
DISTRICT OF AUG 20
ROPERTS 1968
Thomas wille Jurniture Sad. Clerk's No. C.A. (GEARNS, 61894
<i>vs.</i>
Abraham L. Kommenstein U.S. Marshal's No.
SERVICE COMPLETED or ENDEAVOR TO SERVE
I hereby certify and return that I endeavored to serve the annexed Scampon & Compound
on the therein-named Abraham L. K. MILLS Level (Name of individual, company, corporation, etc.)
by handing to and leaving a true and correct copy thereof with (if endeavor—describe what was
done in endeavoring to serve)
personally at (if endeavor—show addresses where endeavors made) Library of Concress Angex (Address-Street number, Japartment number, rural route, etc.)
in the said District (State)
at day of, 19, 19
SERVICE NOT COMPLETED
Date AUG 2 2 1968
I hereby certify and return, that on the day of, 1968,
I received the within Summer and that after
diligent search, I am unable to find the within named abraham L. Kamenstein
UNABLE TO CONTACT within said district.
LUKE C. MOORE
Marshal's fees United States Marshal.
Mileage By Culterbur (Miss) Deputy.

GPO: 1967-O-260-803

United States District Court

District of Columbia

CIVIL ACTION FILE No. 1959-68

SUMMONS

THOMASVILLE FURNITURE INDUSTRIES, INC.

Ws 340.

Plaintiff

V.

ABRAHAM L. KAMINSTEIN, Registrar of Copyrights

Defendant

To the above named Defendant:

You are hereby summoned and required to serve upon

Cushman, Darby & Cushman James L. Dooley

plaintiff's attorney, whose address is 730 15th St., N. W.

an answer to the complaint which is herewith served upon you, within days after service of this summons upon you, exclusive of the day of service. If you fail to do so, judgement by default will be taken against you for the relief demanded in the complaint.

ROBERT M. STEARNS

Clerk of Court.

Denutu Clerk

[Seal of Court]

Date: August 27, 1968

RETURN ON SERVICE OF WRIT

day of

19

I hereby certify and return, that on the

I recei	ved this sur	nmons and	d served it t	ogether w	vith the	complaiı	nt herein a	s follow	s:		
J								200 ₁ 1	10.00		
											.1
						9			£	12 7 W. F	
			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·								
ľ	MARSHAL'S	FEES	477 42 477	pl .						States Ma	mahal
	\$ •					_					
001 7100	Quality and a second					Ву		Deput	y United	States Mo	rshal.
Su	ıbscribed ar	nd sworn t	o before me	а				th			
day of		1 108	, 19 .	,				011			
			, 10 .								
[SEAL]						*********	***************************************	**********		***************************************	
No	te:—Affidavit	required or	ıly if service i	s made by	a person	other tha	n a United S	States Ma	ırshal or h	is Deputy.	
1		1	1		1 1	ays				1.	
					Z	da				Hintiff	
	nut				SUMMONS IN CIVIL ACTION					Attorney for Plaints	
	Anited States District Court FOR THE				AC					rney j	-5003
	istriu				VII	than				Atto	-140M-
	がよ		8		C	ter					20-65-
	State	Ĭ			SI	ot la				/2. (192	.K7-
No.	स्व				ION	e no					FPI-LK-7-20-65-140M-5003
	Ami				IMIN	nabl	vice.				
					SI	Returnable not later than	after service.				
						F	afte				-

Table and the Control of the State of the St

NOTES A TUALLY NEEDS NOW

RETU... ON SERVICE OF WRIT

United States of America
DISTRICT OF AUG 28 10
Thomasulf. Fun Ind. La Clerk's No. ROBERT M. STEARNS, Clerk
vs. a & Kamenstein Rig of capyright U.S. Marshal's No. CA 1959-68
SERVICE COMPLETED or ENDEAVOR TO SERVE
I hereby certify and return that I endeavored to serve the annexed (Writ)
on the therein-named Register of Copyrights Library of Congress (Name of individual, company, corporation, etc.)
by handing to and leaving a true and correct copy thereof with (if endeavor—describe what was
done in endeavoring to serve) Bulka Quelos Lec. (Name of individual or agent of company, corporation, etc.)
personally at (if endeavor—show addresses where endeavors made) (Address—Street number, apartment number, rural route, etc.)
(Address—Street number, apartment number, rural route, etc.) in the said District (State) at
SERVICE NOT COMPLETED
Date
I hereby certify and return, that on the day of, 19,
I received the within and that after
diligent search, I am unable to find the within named
within said district.
LUKE C. MOORE
Marshal's fees

Deputy.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

THOMASVILLE FURNITURE INDUSTRIES, INC.,

Plaintiff,

v.

ABRAHAM L. KAMINSTEIN, REGISTER OF COPYRIGHTS, COPYRIGHT OFFICE, LIBRARY OF CONGRESS WASHINGTON, D. C. 20540

Defendant.

Civil Action
No. 1959-68

ROBERT M. STEARNS, Clerk

ANSWER TO

COMPLAINT FOR DECLARATORY
JUDGMENT AND MANDATORY INJUNCTION
UNDER THE COPYRIGHT LAWS, TITLE 17 U.S.C.

Comes now the defendant, by his attorney, the United States Attorney and in answer to the complaint avers as follows:

First Defense

The complaint fails to state a claim against defendant upon which relief can be granted.

Second Defense

Answering specifically the numbered paragraphs of the complaint, defendant avers as follows:

- 1. Defendant denies the allegations in paragraph 1 concerning jurisdiction and further denies that plaintiff has a cause of action against defendant.
- 2. Defendant is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief and therefore denies each and every allegation in paragraph 2.
 - 3. Defendant admits the allegations in paragraph 3.
 - 4. Defendant denies the allegations in paragraph 4.
- 5. Defendant denies that the alleged "designs" are "artistically sculpted," but is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief and therefore denies the remaining allegations in paragraph 5.

- 6. As to the allegations in paragraph 6, defendant denies that plaintiff has a valid claim to copyright in any of the alleged "designs"; admits that on May 8, 1968. plaintiff filed with the defendant eight applications, one for each of the eight alleged "designs," for registration of claims to copyright in Class G which pertains to "works of art and designs for works of art"; admits that with each such application, plaintiff deposited, in lieu of copies of the work as provided by section 13 of Title 17 of the United States Code and section 202.16 of the Regulations of the Copyright Office (37 C.F.R.), photographs of an article of furniture which purported to incorporate the alleged "design," a different article of furniture being the subject of each of the eight applications; and admits that with each such application plaintiff also tendered the registration fee of \$6.00.
- 7. As to the allegations in paragraph 7, defendant denies that plaintiff has fully complied with all the provisions of Title 17, United States Code, with respect to each of the alleged "designs"; is without knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief and therefore denies that plaintiff has fully complied with the provisions of Title 17 as to the notice of copyright on the copies of each article of furniture purporting to incorporate each of the alleged "designs"; admits that, with respect to each such article of furniture, plaintiff has complied with the provisions of Title 17 as to the filing of an application for registration of claim to copyright, as to the deposit of photographs of the furniture in lieu of copies, and as to the tender of the registration fee.

- 8. Defendant admits that on May 27, 1968, the defendant refused to register the plaintiff's claims to copyright for the alleged "designs" represented by the articles of furniture of which photographs were deposited with the applications for registration, on the ground stated in defendant's letter of May 27, 1968 to plaintiff's counsel, a copy of which letter is attached hereto as Exhibit A and incorporated herein by reference, but defendant denies the remaining allegations in paragraph 8.
 - 9. Defendant admits the allegations in paragraph 9.
 Third Defense

Defendant avers that none of the eight articles of furniture, of which photographs were deposited by plaintiff with eight applications for the registration of copyright claims, constitutes or embodies a copyrightable work of art or a copyrightable work of any other category under the Copyright Law, Title 17 of the United States Code, and that none of the copyright claims asserted in the eight applications is entitled to registration.

WHEREFORE, defendant prays that the complaint be dismissed.

DAVID BRESS United States Attorney

JOSEPH M. HANNON
Assistant United States
Attorney

WILLIAM W. FLEMING Attorney, Department of

Justice Patent Section, Civil Division

Department of Justice Washington, D.C. 20530 RE-7-8200, Ext. 3329

Certificate of Service

Copy of the foregoing Answer to Complaint for Declaratory Judgment and Mandatory Injunction under the Copyright Laws, Title 17, U.S.C., including the exhibit attached thereto, was served on James L. Dooley, Esq., attorney for the plaintiff, by mailing to him, postpage prepaid, at his address: 730 15th Street, N.W., Washington, D.C. 20005, this 26th day of September, 1968.

WILLIAM W. FLEMING Attorney, Department of Justice

XX 20540

CB:sit 3-23-68 m.c-1959-68

E.I.L.E.D.

Cushman, Darby & Cushman 730 Fifteenth Street, N. W. Washington, D. C. 20005

SEP 26 1968

ROBERT M. STEARNS; Clerk Attention: James L. Dooley, Esquire

Dear Hr. Dooley:

We have received the material you vicently submitted in connection with the work ALLEGRO CORNER DESK and 70 others.

Nothing can be copyrighted upless it is the "writing of an author." To be regarded as a "writing a work rust contain original creative authorship in the form of literary, musical or artistic expression.

Copyrightable writings include backs, musical composi-tions, and works of art such as paintings, drawings, and statues. To be copyrightable as a work of art a work must centain at least a certain minimum amount of original MicroMal graphic, or schiptural expression.

The courts have held that an original "work of art" may be eligible for copyright protection, even if it is embodied in or applied to a useful article. Section 202. No (c) of the regulations expresses our position on this point. Please see the attached Circular 96D.

to regret that we find this work contains no elements, either alone of in combination, which are capable of independent existence as a pictorial, graphic, of aculptured work. It may be that the design elements are of high dedthetic quality, originality and commercial value, but the fact remains that they cannot be considered works of art" within the coming of the present copyright law.

Since neither the design as a whole nor any part of it can be identified as a work of art for copyright purposes, your remittance will be refunded shortly under separate cover.

Znclosures:

8 sets of photos returned Circular 960

Under Separate Cover:

Tr. Ck. 348.00- in due course

Sincerely yours, Dorothy H. Schrader Head. Arts Section Examining Division

THOUSE WALL

By:

COPYRIGHT OFFICE THE LIBRARY OF CONGRESS

WASHINGTON, D. C. 20540

Ca. 1959-68

Exhibit

SECTIONS 202.9 through 202.14 of the

Regulations of the Copyright Office (As amended through April 21, 1966)

§ 202.9 Maps (Class F). ROBERT M. STEARNS, Clerk

This class includes all published cartographic representations of area, such as terrestrial maps and atlases, marine charts, celestial maps and such three-dimensional works as globes and relief models.

§ 202.10 Works of art (Class G).

- (a) General. This class includes published or unpublished works of artistic craftsmanship, insofar as their form but not their mechanical or utilitarian aspects are concerned, such as artistic jewelry, enamels, glassware, and tapestries, as well as works belonging to the fine arts, such as paintings, drawings and sculpture.
- (b) In order to be acceptable as a work of art, the work must embody some creative authorship in its delineation or form. The registrability of a work of art is not affected by the intention of the author as to the use of the work, the number of copies reproduced, or the fact that it appears on a textile material or textile product. The potential availability of protection under the design patent law will not affect the registrability of a work of art, but a copyright claim in a patented design or in the drawings or photographs in a patent application will not be registered after the patent has been issued.
- (c) If the sole intrinsic function of an article is its utility, the fact that the article is unique and attractively shaped will not qualify it as a work of art. However, if the shape of a utilitarian article incorporates features, such as artistic sculpture, carving, or pictorial representation, which can be identified separately and are capable of existing independently as a work of art, such features will be eligible for registration.

Reproductions of works of art (Class H). § 202.11

This class includes published reproductions of existing works of art in the same or a different medium, such as a lithograph, photoengraving, etching or drawing of a painting, sculpture or other work of art.

§ 202.12 Drawings or plastic works of a scientific or technical character (Class I).

(a) This class includes published or unpublished two-dimensional drawings and threedimensional plastic works which have been designed for a scientific or technical use and which contain copyrightable graphic, pictorial, or sculptured materials. Works registrable in Class I include diagrams or models illustrating scientific or technical works or formulating scientific or technical information in linear or plastic form, such as, for example: a mechanical drawing, an astronomical chart, an architect's blueprint, an anatomical model, or an engineering diagram.

- (b) A work is not eligible for registration as a "plastic" work in Class I merely because it is formed from one of the commonly known synthetic chemical derivatives such as styrenes, vinyl compounds, or acrylic resins. The term "plastic work" as used in this context refers to a three-dimensional work giving the effect of that which is molded or sculptured. Examples of such works include statues of animals or plants used for scientific or educational purposes, and engineers' scale models.
- (c) A claim to copyright in a scientific or technical drawing, otherwise registrable in Class I, will not be refused registration solely by reason of the fact that it is known to form a part of a pending patent application. Where the patent has been issued, however, the claim to copyright in the drawing will be denied copyright registration.

§ 202.13 Photographs (Class J).

This class includes published or unpublished photographic prints and filmstrips, slide films and individual slides. Photoengravings and other photomechanical reproductions of photographs are registered in Class K on Form K.

§ 202.14 Prints, pictorial illustrations and commercial prints or labels (Class K).

- (a) This class includes prints or pictorial illustrations, greeting cards, picture postcards and similar prints, produced by means of lithography, photoengraving or other methods of reproduction. These works when published are registered on Form K.
- (b) A print or label, not a trademark, containing copyrightable pictorial matter, text, or both, published in connection with the sale or advertisement of an article or articles of merchandise is also registered in this class on Form KK. In the case of a print which is published in a periodical, use Form KK if the print is used in connection with the sale or advertisement of an article of merchandise, Form BB if it is not. Multipage works are more appropriately classified in Class A than in Class K.
- (c) A claim to copyright cannot be registered in a print or label consisting solely of trademark subject matter and lacking copyrightable matter. While the Copyright Office will not investigate whether the matter has been or can be registered at the Patent Office, it will register a properly filed copyright claim in a print or label that contains the requisite qualifications for copyright even though there is a trademark on it. However, registration of a claim to copyright does not give the claimant rights available by trademark registrations at the Patent Office.

Civil No. 1959-68
THOMASVILLE FURNITURE INDUSTRIES, INC. Plaintiff, vs.
KAMINSTEIN Defendant.
3000
CAUSE CALENDARED Sep. 26, 1968
Attorney for plaintiff: Cushman, Darby & Cushman 730 - 15th St., N. W.
Attorney for defendant: David G. Bress
U. S. Courthouse
The suit is forDECLARATORY
ROBERT M. STEARNS, Clerk

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

THOMASVILLE FURNITURE INDUSTRIES, INC.,

Plaintiff,

Civil Action

ABRAHAM L. KAMINSTEIN, REGISTER OF COPYRIGHTS

No. 1959-68

Defendant.

JAN 3 1969

STIPULATION OF DISMISSAL UNDER RULE 41(a)(1)

ROBERT M. STEARNS, Clerk

Now come the parties to this action, Thomasville Furniture Industries, Inc. and Abraham L. Kaminstein, in his capacity as Register of Copyrights for the United States, by and through their respective counsel, and mutually agree and stipulate that the plaintiff's complaint herein be, and hereby is, dismissed with prejudice.

The parties state that no counterclaim, cross claim or third party claim has been filed in this action, and therefore no further matters requiring attention by the Court shall remain pending in this action.

> es L. Dooley, ttorney for Plaintiff

Attorney, Department of Justice

ROBERT M. STEARNS, Clerk